

## CITES Sustainable Users Group (CSUG) meeting

11:00-13:00, 25<sup>th</sup> Jan 2018

Room G2, Horizon House, Bristol, Defra

### Minutes

#### **Attendees:**

Drew Bain (Guild of Taxidermists)  
Steven Beadle (IOA)  
Peter Beare (EILA)  
Elizabeth Biott (Defra)  
Jim Collins (SUN)  
Alejandro Doyle (Defra)  
Vin Fleming (JNCC)  
Mike Gates (Owl Society)  
Rhiannon Hudson-Jones (Defra)  
Graham Irving (The Hawk Board)  
Elaine Kendall (Defra - chair)  
Alison Littlewood (JNCC)  
Kim McDonald (Guild of Taxidermists)  
Sam Miller (Burberry)  
Mike Moser (British Trade Fur Association)  
Fran Nicholls (APHA)  
Dr Kirsten Pullen (BIAZA)

Hazel Preller (APHA)  
Rose Simpson (KEW)  
Elif Skinner (Defra)  
Denise Valin (Burberry)  
Dominic Whitmee (OATA)  
Peter Wood (Glass Eels)  
Simon Woods (APHA)

#### **Dialling-in:**

Matt Ford (Specialist Wildlife Services)  
Laurence Jessup (Border Force)  
Amy Mathias (Border Force)  
Alan Roberts (NWCUC)  
Kate Tonizzo (Christie's)

#### **Apologies:**

Bryan Carroll (Bristol Zoological Society)  
Louise Hubble (NWCUC)  
Jenny Lomas (ABO)  
Paul McManus (MIA)  
Grant Miller (Border Force)  
Nicky Needham (BIAZA)  
Conor Ogorman (BASC)  
Jemima Parry-Jones MBE (ICBP)  
Noeleen Smyth (KEW)  
Annelies Stevens (Christie's)

#### **1. Welcome & introductions**

Elaine Kendall (E.K) welcomed the attendees.

#### **2. Agree minutes from meeting of 7<sup>th</sup> Nov 2017 and action point update**

The minutes from the previous meeting were agreed and adopted.

**AP1:** Defra to circulate an organogram of Defra and APHA team contact details with the minutes. **Update:** *Completed - an organogram was circulated on 8 January.*

**AP2:** Defra to provide Dominic Whitmee (DW) with contact details for the Defra Illegal Wildlife Trade Team. **Update:** *EK confirmed that best way to reach the IWT Team is via the team's shared mailbox: [IllegalWildlifeTrade@defra.gsi.gov.uk](mailto:IllegalWildlifeTrade@defra.gsi.gov.uk).*

**AP3:** Defra to organise a meeting with the MIA, Kim McDonald (KMc), at least one auction house and instrument dealer to discuss the Dalbergia issue. **Update:** *Completed – a meeting was held on 18<sup>th</sup> December. See Item 5ii below.*

**AP4:** EK and DW to discuss how the system should be implemented to control the Bsal pathogen. **Update:** *DW has been discussing this with another Defra team and confirmed that he is happy to continue to work with that team on this issue.*

**AP5:** Comments to Noeleen Smyth on amendments to Annotation #15 by close 10 November. **Update:** *Completed - KEW received two emails from traders.*

**AP6:** Defra to look up Management Committee dates for 2018 and circulate to the group. **Update:** *Completed – the date of the next meeting (6 February) was circulated with the agenda.*

**AP7:** Alison Littlewood (A.L) to look into this [the reasoning behind putting a prohibition on importation of two Tanzanian chameleons (*Furcifer Spp.*) and several species of Madagascan Day Geckos (*Phelsuma Spp.*)] and provide Jim Collins (SUN) with information directly. **Update:** *Alison confirmed that the CITES Secretariat website indicates that the following species are suspended from Madagascar: *Furcifer labordi*; *Phelsuma borai*, *P. breviceps*, *P. gouldi* and *P. standing*. *Furcifer spp.* and *Phelsuma spp.* were both selected for review under the Significant Trade Review process (Conf Res 12.8 RevCoP17) due to concerns over implementation of Article IV of the Convention, with a number of species retained in the process and subject to recommendations / remedial action. These recommendations have not been complied with and a trade suspension was issued by the Standing Committee. Recommendations to suspend trade may be withdrawn immediately upon a country's return to compliance. There are no *Furcifer spp.* native to Tanzania.*

**AP8:** Defra to feedback this information on the use of better quality rings to the Defra Wild Birds Team and to check if anything is happening through that team. **Update:** *EK has spoken to the Birds Team and they will be providing an answer.*

**AP9:** A.L to check if corals are on the agenda. **Update:** *Alison confirmed that corals are on the agenda for the next SRG under item 4.6.*

**AP10:** Simon Woods (S.W) to take away and investigate timescales for APHA BIP charges and to speak to the Plant Health Team regarding their charging consultation. **Update:** *S.W said that there was no update on APHA BIP charges since the last meeting and a response is still expected from ministers in April 2018.*

**AP11:** Group members interested in joining a Brexit sub group to inform Jim Collins (J.C). JC to relay a list of attendees to Elaine for a meeting to be organised.

**Update:** *Completed – a meeting is being held on 1<sup>st</sup> March.*

**AP12:** Dominic Whitmee (OATA) to send details of business industry meetings to Elaine Kendall. **Update:** *Completed – this is being followed up by Michael Sigsworth.*

**AP13:** Graham Irving (The Hawk Board) to send Elaine Kendall the arguments for putting forward these two species [captive bred goshawks and golden eagles].

**Update:** *Graham has not sent Elaine any information but Elaine confirmed that this is an issue for the Bird's Team. See Item 7 below.*

**AP14:** Group members to submit specific examples to Laurence Jessup (UKBF) where certificates have not been stamped. **Update:** *Laurence confirmed that he has not yet been sent specific examples.*

**AP15:** Dominic Whitmee (OATA) to co-ordinate a meeting to discuss the problems experienced by imported at BIPs. **Update:** *Simon Woods will arrange a meeting with traders.*

### **3. Corporate update**

EK reported that Nicola Leeds has taken over from Jane Stratford heading up the species side of Defra International.

S.W reported that Dale McMullan has now started and is the new Head of International Trade and Customer Service Centres.

Louise Hubble is now head of the National Wildlife Crime Unit.

### **4. EU and international meetings – review and forward look**

#### **(i) Review of Enforcement Group, 6-8<sup>th</sup> Nov 2017**

No updates to report.

#### **(ii) Review of 81<sup>st</sup> [Scientific Review Group](#), 13<sup>th</sup> November 2017**

Rose Simpson (Kew) said there was much discussion over the term artificially propagated and that there will be an intersessional working group on this definition. Other issues included export of snow drops from Georgia, timber report submitted by Germany, items with source code “w” from India.

The definition of final product / handicraft still needs clarification.

A.L (JNCC) reported that the zero export quota for eels from the EU was extended for 3 years. In response to this, Peter Wood (Glass Eels) said that the zero export quota is not working and is resulting in illegal exporting to Asia by criminals. Allan Roberts said this was on the radar of the NWCU. Vin Fleming (V.F) stated he is aware of the issues Peter raised and that steps are being taken within CITES.

VF mentioned that this issue was raised at the Standing Committee and that a decision was taken to look at what we have learnt from illegal trade in eels. There will be an Animals Committee working group to discuss the lessons learnt which Vin will be chairing.

JNCC have commissioned a pilot study on the real costs of wildlife crime – glass eels will be a case study in which they will examine implications such as traders being priced out of the market by illegal trade.

**(iii) Review of 80<sup>th</sup> Management Committee and 9<sup>th</sup> [Expert Group](#), 14<sup>th</sup> November 2017**

EK attended, report is available on line.

**(iv) Review of 69<sup>th</sup> Standing Committee ([SC69](#)), 27<sup>th</sup> November - 1 December 2017**

EK reported that the EU and the Member States, including the UK, had worked hard on securing stronger compliance measures against countries who have not made sufficient progress or who have persistently ignored SC/COP decisions. Although the outcomes were not as strong as we had hoped for, good progress was made (e.g. sei whales-Japan).

EK stated that the Standing Committee agreed on interim definitions of the terms "non-commercial", "exports", and "total weight of 10 kg per shipment" in paragraph b) of annotation #15 in order to facilitate the implementation of the listing of *Dalbergia* spp.

The SC established a total of 27 intersessional working groups and the UK has been invited to chair the rhino WG. The UK is involved in eleven in total; everyone was invited to input should they wish to do so.

**Action Point 1:** Defra to circulate a list of the working groups the UK is involved in:

(1) Annotations (2) African lion (3) Cybercrime (4) Simplified procedure for permits and certificates (5) Sharks and rays (6) Specimens from synthetic DNA (7) Great apes (8) Disposal of confiscated specimens (9) Definition of the term 'appropriate and acceptable destinations' (10) Electronic system and information technologies (11) Resolution 10.9.

Summary record of the 69<sup>th</sup> meeting of the Standing Committee can be found [here](#).

**(v) Upcoming 82<sup>nd</sup> Scientific Review Group (SRG), 5<sup>th</sup> Feb**

Brief discussion of upcoming meeting.

## **(vi) Upcoming 81<sup>st</sup> Management Committee & 10<sup>th</sup> Expert Group, 6<sup>th</sup> Feb;**

EK and EB will be attending this meeting. Key items include preparations of the 18<sup>th</sup> CITES CoP in Sri Lanka next year, ivory, rosewood, the EU Action Plan against Wildlife Trafficking and rhino horn guidance, transit of whale meat and eels.

### **5. Updates:**

#### **(i) UK ivory controls**

EK stated that the UK ivory consultation closed on 29 December 2017. Analysis of the ivory consultation is ongoing and a response will be published shortly. The date for the bill is currently unknown.

#### **(ii) Rosewood**

EK reported that on 18 December 2017 a meeting was held between Defra and musical instrument industry representatives, including an auction house and instrument dealers, to discuss the Dalbergia issue. Defra found the meeting very useful to understand where the problems are occurring and to hear examples of specific cases.

Following this brief report, some attendees suggested that usage of rosewood in the music industry is minimal and that the real issue lies with China using this material for furniture.

It was discussed how rosewood is an essential but minimal material for some musical instruments such as violins where it is only used for pegs and that there are not any alternatives that tune properly. Rose Simpson mentioned that CITES needs to address how to quantify usage of plants as there have been examples of permits not being issued for containers of instruments although the actual quantity of the restricted wood is minimal.

Peter Beare asked if there could be support for exemptions for musical instruments as is being considered for ivory.

<p><b>Action Point 2:</b> Defra to discuss with Noeleen Smyth (Kew) as to whether exemptions for musical instruments could be raised through the Annotations Working Group.</p>
---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Some attendees raised issues around the permanent marking and rosewood and whether there could be specimen specific permits or at least agreement that pre 1992 guitars are legal. Currently, in some cases there seems to be a problem with proving to APHA that a guitar containing Dalbergia was legally imported to the EU prior to 1992. Some stated that this isn't possible in many cases as documentation no longer exists. It is therefore not possible to get an Article 10 even in cases where there is proof that the guitar was made before 1992.

**Action Point 3:** Defra and APHA to consider options around specimen specific permits or granting Article 10 certificates to guitars made before 1992.

### **(iii) APHA inspection charges**

It was agreed that Simon Woods would discuss this separately with the relevant attendees.

### **(iv) COTES**

The intention is to lay the legislation in spring and for it to come into force in October 2018. There will be civil sanctions for some new offences.

A couple of questions were raised for Defra to think about. Firstly, how A10 numbers can be placed on adverts for unhatched birds. Currently, A10s are applied for once the birds and reptiles have hatched.

Secondly, there are problems where people have had animals like tortoises and parrots for years. If they have to be rehomed it is difficult for a vet to age a tortoise and therefore obtain the necessary permits. EK said that these issues would be considered and would welcome further information on these.

## **6. Brexit matters**

There was only a brief discussion around Brexit matters due to the in depth meeting that will be going ahead on 1st March.

EK confirmed that Sam Miller (Burberry) could attend this meeting.

## **7. Non-CITES**

EK explained that due to the time needing to be spent on CITES matters, future CSUG meetings would focus solely on CITES. Contact details would be provided so that CSUG members could build relationships with wider Defra contacts.

### **(i) Birds matters**

EK said that questions on non-CITES bird matters have been passed to the Birds Team who will respond separately.

**Action Point 4:** Defra to put Steve Beadle in contact with the Birds Team.

### **(ii) Circus / mobile animal exhibits**

EK had received confirmation from the Animal Welfare and Exotic Disease Control Team that the animal exhibits legislation will come into force on 1 October 2018.

A question was raised over when the consultation would be held.

**Action Point 5:** Defra to check when the consultation would be held with the Animal Welfare and Exotic Disease Control Team.

## 8. AOB and next meeting

There was discussion around CITES notification 2018/004 relating to a questionnaire on orchids. Denise Valin suggested that she had some contacts that she could share with Kew who could assist with the questionnaire.

**Action Point 6:** Denise Valin to pass business contacts on to Rose Simpson.

Issues were raised by Mike Moser around the trading of fur and concerns that there may be moves to ban the import of fur after Brexit. He made the point that their trade is legitimate and sustainable.

**Action Point 7:** Defra to provide Mike Moser with the relevant contact details for the Defra team dealing with trade policy.

Vin Fleming mentioned that as part of the preparation for EU exit, JNCC have commissioned an analysis of imports and exports and they are looking for case studies.

**Action Point 8:** Vin Fleming to circulate details of the study to CSUG members.

DW requested to receive CITES Liaison Group (CLG) meeting minutes and stated that in the past the CLG and CSUG minutes used to be shared between the two groups.

**Action Point 9:** Defra to check with the CLG members to see if they would be happy to share CLG meeting minutes with CSUG members.

DW mentioned that BEIS is struggling to get representation from Defra and Border Force in meetings.

**Action Point 10:** EK to follow up.

Date of next meeting to be confirmed.